REPORT OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL ON COMMUNITY-BASED PROGRAMS FOR WOMEN

June 18, 1990

EC
G5681
D.P46
1990

90-07005/

June 18, 1990

The Honourable Carol Gran
Minister of Government Management
Services and Minister Responsible for
Women's Programs
Parliament Buildings
Victoria, British Columbia
V8V 1X4

Dear Madam Minister:

It is our privilege to submit for your consideration the report and recommendations of the Advisory Council on Community-Based Programs for Women.

Sincerely,

Ms. Susan Brice
Chairperson

Ms. Robin LeDrew

Ms. Kathie Taylor

Ms. Finola Finlay

Ms. Betty McClurg

Dr. Rozmin Kamani

Ms. Lois Hollstedt

Ms. Irene McRae

Ms. Patreace Sinclair

Ms. Mobina Jaffer

Ms. Bette Pepper

Ms. Ruth Williams

Attachment

DDF/jm
LCG05291
202-20/ACCP

Recycled Paper

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Advisory Council on Community-Based Programs for Women was charged with the responsibility for recommending ways in which programs could be funded and delivered more effectively to women in their communities. The Council's recommendations reflect an attempt to integrate women's needs at all levels of government and community planning.

Many excellent delivery systems exist in communities around the province. The delivery system proposed by the Advisory Council builds on communities' existing strengths, as well as addressing service gaps. The proposed delivery system does not result in the imposition of an arbitrary, artificial structure.

There are significant service gaps in most communities across the province. A particular need exists for childcare and a variety of counselling services. The difficulties faced by women in accessing services are intensified for doubly disadvantaged women. The Council recommends the following initiatives:

* **increased affordable, quality daycare spaces;**
* **additional and enhanced counselling services;**
* **increased training and education funding;**
* **assistance to community groups to enhance service delivery to women;**
* **increased availability of, and accessibility to, English as a Second Language training; and**
* **sufficient funding to the Ministry Responsible for Women's Programs to ensure these initiatives are implemented.**

The Advisory Council emphasizes that the delivery of community-based services to women must be supported by provincial government planning which addresses service availability, accessibility, adequacy and coordination. The Council recommends the following initiatives be taken within government:

* **assess impact on women of existing and future policies;**
* **require ministries' actions plans to respond to women's service needs;**

* **develop a means to ensure equal representation of women in decision-making bodies;**

* **establish a Task Force to address the feminization of poverty;**

* **appoint the Minister Responsible for Women's Programs to Treasury Board;**

* **establish a sub-committee of Cabinet Committee on Social Policy, chaired by the Minister Responsible for Women's Programs, to address issues affecting women; and**

* **establish regional interministry planning and coordination committees.**

Government needs to signal its commitment to women by taking a leadership role with women in the public service to ensure equal representation in senior management, and by taking action to raise public awareness of women's issues and women's contributions.

Specific monitoring and evaluation activities must be undertaken to ensure that progress is made, including the following:

* **gathering and maintaining statistical program and personnel data by gender and community; and**

* **establishing a Standing Advisory Council to advise the Minister on the implementation of the initiatives outlined in this report.**

These recommendations represent a considerable challenge for government. It is the opinion of the Advisory Council that the majority of the women of British Columbia, both individually and through their different organizations, will support the provincial government's efforts to implement these recommendations.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Acknowledgements	(i)
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. VISION STATEMENT	3
III. SERVICES FOR WOMEN	4
A. Current Services	4
1. Services Targeted Specifically or Primarily to Women	4
2. Services Essential to the Needs of Women	5
3. Services Impacting Women as Caregivers	5
B. Service Delivery Issues	6
1. Accessibility	6
2. Adequacy	7
3. Service Gaps	10
IV. SERVICE DELIVERY	13
A. The Existing Delivery Structure	13
B. Delivery Considerations	14
1. Service Availability, Accessibility and Adequacy	14
2. Public Education, Information and Awareness	15
3. Women in Decision-Making and Leadership	17
4. Coordination and Planning	18

TABLE OF CONTENTS (cont'd)

		Page
C.	Delivery Systems	20
1.	Supporting Principles for Proposed Delivery System	20
2.	Levels of Need	21
3.	Criteria for Effective Service Delivery	21
4.	Evaluation	24
V.	**ACTION PLAN AND RECOMMENDATIONS**	25
A.	Development of Effective Planning Processes	25
B.	Effective Delivery of Required Services	27
C.	Coordination Between Government and Community	29
D.	Leadership Initiatives	29
E.	Monitoring and Evaluating for Results	30

APPENDIX A Advisory Council Members

APPENDIX B Terms of Reference

APPENDIX C Government Representatives and Observers

Acknowledgements

The Advisory Council worked intensively over a short time period to produce its final report. The Council wishes to thank provincial government ministries for their cooperation and support in providing the Council with briefing notes and presentations on provincial government programs that impact women. The Council appreciates the assistance provided by Women's Programs staff in preparing this report. The Council also wishes to acknowledge the assistance of Ms. Wendy Carter, Regional Director, B.C./Yukon Region, Secretary of State.

I. INTRODUCTION

On April 3rd, 1990, the Honourable Carol Gran, Minister Responsible for Women's Programs, appointed an advisory committee made up of women from across British Columbia. The Council was given a dual mandate: to identify gaps and possible duplications in services to women; and, to recommend a long-term strategy for community-based program delivery involving coordination of existing community and government services. The list of Council members and Terms of Reference are contained in Appendices A and B.

It was recognized that it is unrealistic and impractical for government to be expected to provide for all the needs of women. Communities, through not-for-profit organizations, volunteers, peer groups, etc., are in the best position to address many concerns. The Ministry Responsible for Women's Programs must play an important role by promoting the development of community-based delivery structures which constantly re-evaluate the needs of women in their communities. Further, the Ministry Responsible for Women's Programs must ensure that services which are legitimately provided through various government ministries are responsive to the real needs of women, are coordinated with other ministries and are accessible through the community delivery structure.

Earlier in the year, the federal government announced the discontinuation of core funding to Women's Centres effective March 31, 1990. This funding cut increased the pressure to develop a strategy for effective community-based delivery programs. During the course of the Council's deliberations, the federal government decided to provide transitional funding for Women's Centres for fiscal 90/91.

The Council met for nine days over a two-month period from April 9 to June 4, 1990. Presentations were made or tabled by the Ministries of Social Services and Housing; Health; Advanced Education, Training and Technology; Education; Attorney-General; Solicitor-General; Regional and Economic Development; International Business and Immigration; and Labour and Consumer Services (Alcohol and Drug Program).

The information provided by ministries, while not definitive, formed the basis of a general survey which included specific program information such as: program objective, target population, women served by program, type of delivery model, budget allocated, locations served and interfaces with other ministries and organizations.

Additional information and presentations were tabled by Council members on the following specific issues: abused women, street women, women's health issues, immigrant women, women in the workforce, women in isolated communities, Native women and poor women. In addition, a variety of existing delivery models such as multi-service organizations, single focus agencies, and community councils were presented.

The Honourable Carol Gran has committed $250,000 as a first step towards implementing the Advisory Council's recommendations for delivery of community-based programs. This funding should not preclude negotiations with the federal government regarding shared funding of Women's Centres for 1991/92.

II. VISION STATEMENT

The Advisory Council for Community-Based Programs for Women was charged with the responsibility for recommending ways in which programs could be funded and delivered more effectively to women in their communities.*

The motivation behind this objective was not simply one of efficiency or effectiveness. Rather, it was an attempt to establish a means to assist society to create a different reality: a reality based on respect for the rights of women to security, personal safety and well-being; a reality which recognizes and supports the dual role played by many women as caregivers and paid workers; a reality in which women's social, economic and political contributions are encouraged and valued equally; and a reality in which women have an equal share in power and influence. These realities do not yet exist.

This report examines the existing network of services in light of this vision and outlines the following steps to achieve a new reality for women: improving access, expanding services, filling gaps, more effectively coordinating existing services at the community level and planning for future services.

* The Advisory Council has chosen to view communities in a broad context in which they could be defined in terms of geography or in terms of shared interests or needs.

III. SERVICES FOR WOMEN

The Council examined existing provincial government services from the perspective of availability and accessibility. It is to be noted, however, that provincial government programs make up only one part of the service delivery practice. Municipal and federal government programs and voluntary programs at the local level make up the others.

A. Current Services

Provincial government ministries currently deliver a wide variety of services to women; other levels of government provide services as well. Added to this base of service are those services provided through the voluntary sector through organizations such as Women's Centres, community and family service agencies and others. This value-added approach has enabled communities to respond flexibly to changing needs. However, while a lot is being done there are still insufficient services to meet the needs.

An important facet of the current delivery of community programs is the partnership between government and community organizations. Community-based contractors play an important role in the delivery of service, in identifying needs and in assisting government in service planning. The importance of this partnership is exemplified in the scope of purchase of service contracting.

Provincial government services were broadly grouped as follows: services targeted specifically or primarily to women; services essential to the needs of women; and services which impact women as caregivers.

1. Services Targeted Specifically or Primarily to Women

Few programs are targeted specifically to women. The most obvious example is the Women's Grants Funding Program which is intended to assist women to achieve equal participation in all aspects of social, economic and political life.

Specifically targeted services in line ministries fall into two categories: services which respond to women's biological needs; and services which respond to women who have been physically or emotionally abused. An example of the former is the Ministry of Health's Pregnancy Outreach Program. Examples of the latter are Ministry of Attorney-General's Wife Assault Coordination Project and the Ministry of Social Services and Housing's Transition House/Safe Home Program.

2. **Services Essential to the Needs of Women**

Regrettably, there are many valuable programs essential to the needs of women which, while available to women, are offered to interest groups with no reference to gender and are not easily accessible to women.

Eligibility criteria and program design may create unintended barriers to women needing access to programs. An example is the Ministry of Advanced Education, Training and Technology's Apprenticeship Program which is a gateway to women wishing to enter non-traditional occupations. However, the program does not address the barriers faced by women in accessing non-traditional fields, and does not recognize the tools needed by female apprentices to deal with classroom or job-site discrimination.

3. **Services Impacting Women as Caregivers**

Finally, there are many programs which tend to be accessed primarily by women. This results from women's traditional leadership role in caregiving. The need for these programs is more pronounced for single parents, 82% of whom are women.

The following programs fall under this heading: Ministry of Social Services and Housing's Community Projects Funding; Families First; Specialized Non-Residential Resources; Daycare Support Program; Senior Citizen Counsellors Program. The Ministry of Health's Child/Youth/Family Health Program; Nursing Respite; and Nobody's Perfect Program also fall in this category.

B. Service Delivery Issues

In assessing the existing services delivered by government, four key issues arise:

* service design does not address access by women and this is felt even more by doubly disadvantaged women;

* excellent programs exist but they are not available in sufficient quantity, or are not uniformly available;

* critical service gaps exist; and

* lack of interministry coordination at the regional level which is essential for effective service planning and delivery at the local level.

1. Accessibility

Although some services provided by government are logically targeted to women because of the nature of the service, most services do not differentiate on the basis of gender, and accessibility is assumed to be equal for all.

However, they are in fact gender-biased simply because they fail to take into consideration the unique needs of women as potential consumers of the service. For example, student loans are not available to part-time students, yet attending school part-time is the only option for many women because of their family responsibilities. Another example of how gender bias affects women is seen in the difficulties that women have in accessing credit to start a business.

The Council identified many issues related to legislation and access to justice which have particular impact on women in areas such as: access to legal information; the need for plain language; family law and criminal law and its impact on victims. These issues have been described in detail in the 1988 Report of the Justice Reform Committee. The Council supports the recommendations of the Justice Reform Committee related to these areas and urges the government to implement the recommendations on a priority basis.

2. Adequacy

In some instances, excellent, well-targeted services are available, but in insufficient quantity and in too few locations. Many examples exist in the areas of personal safety and security, health services, programs to support economic independence and legal services. The Council is aware of the following inadequacies and needs:

a) The critical shortage of **affordable, quality daycare** has been cited as a major barrier to women in accessing other services and in achieving economic independence. With 73% of women with children aged 6 - 15 in the labour force, childcare can no longer be viewed as a woman's responsibility. It is a family and societal responsibility. To be able to enter and remain in the labour force, all parents urgently need support that is accessible, affordable and of good quality.

b) The need for **Transition House/Safe Home and Second Stage Housing beds** continues to outstrip the supply. The Council notes that Ministry of Social Services and Housing will provide an additional 100 Transition House beds this year across the province. However, the need continues to exceed even these expanded services. A survey of 25 of the existing 51 Transition Houses in the province, undertaken by the Vancouver YWCA during June 1990, shows that 2531 women with 3499 children requested spaces, but these were not available. This figure does not include women turned away for other reasons.

The Ministry's information system records the occupancy of all available beds throughout the year and indicates that beds are vacant in many communities. However, this reporting system does not capture the demand and turnover at peak periods. This demand is intensified by placement of family groupings. As a result, there is a discrepancy between how the Ministry describes the problem and how Transition Houses describe it. Although, the Ministry of Social Services and Housing generally arranges alternate temporary accommodation for abused women who cannot be

accommodated in Transition Houses by placing them in hostels and motels, many of the women are forced to return to their assaultive spouses.

There is a need for a range of emergency housing including Transition Houses, Safe Homes and Second Stage Housing. Affordable housing is an important factor in enabling women to leave abusive relationships.

c) **Increased access to affordable housing** for single parents, elderly women, disabled women and low income single women is essential. While the first three groups are currently targeted for special needs housing, single women without children are often overlooked. Low income single women living in the urban core are often at greater risk of violence, and have few resources to draw on.

d) **Expansion of community health-related services which promote physical, mental and emotional well-being**, targeted to all groups including the doubly disadvantaged, is urgently needed. These services must provide information and education, counselling and access to all medical services including abortion.

There is also a need for increased availability of reproductive health services including: counselling on responsible sexual behaviour for both sexes, birth control, comprehensive family planning, premenstrual syndrome, postpartum depression and menopause. In addition, there is a need for culturally-sensitive information on all aspects of reproductive health.

Greater emphasis must be placed on a preventative approach in promoting health through provision of education and counselling, both in the school system and at the community level, related to: responsible sexuality; nutrition and eating disorders; stress and lifestyle issues; preventable diseases including those due to smoking and substance abuse, including fetal alcohol syndrome.

The incidence of AIDS in women in the Vancouver area has doubled in the last year and tripled in teenagers. Many of these women have contacted the disease through dirty needles, heterosexual partners or blood transfusions. Action must be taken to stop this increase and to provide treatment and counselling to the women affected and their families.

e) **Increased availability of the very positively received Nobody's Perfect program**, offered by Ministries of Health and Social Services and Housing, to parents with limited parenting skills, is needed.

f) **Increased access to education and training** which is responsive to women's situations, prepares them to earn an adequate living, and increases their representation in occupations such as professions, skilled trades, non-traditional careers and management is essential. Particular emphasis should be placed on the needs of immigrant and Native women for education and training that prepares them for economically viable occupations, and on the needs of women who live in rural and remote areas of B.C. for access to post-secondary opportunities. *

g) **Expansion of the existing Victim Support Program and increased access to sexual assault counselling services** in concert with continued efforts to assist police to deliver programs addressing women's security more effectively is needed.

* The issue of access to post-secondary education for rural students was addressed in both the Access to Advanced Education Report and the Report of the Royal Commission on Education.

3. **Service Gaps**

While it was generally recognized that government provides a wide array of services, there are key areas where services are desperately required and are only being provided on a pilot project or voluntary basis. These services, while recognized as important by individual ministries, are not funded because they do not fit within a specific ministry's mandate.

An excellent example of this is the lack of counselling in the transition house services funded by the Ministry of Social Services and Housing which provide for "...temporary room and board for women and children in a period of personal crisis who may require immediate financial assistance."** There is no allowance made within this program for counselling to assist these women to deal with their situation. Any counselling that does occur is provided on a voluntary basis by the organization, or is included as part of the service on an ad hoc basis as budget allows. While the Ministry may support the need for this type of service, its mandate may preclude it.

The need for all types of counselling services is critical. The following are examples of gaps in counselling services:

* services to battered women who do not use a transition house or who have left and require support to live on their own, or to return to their spouse;

* services to children who have experienced family violence;

* counselling services for assaultive spouses;

* counselling and support services to adult survivors of sexual abuse; and

* counselling services for women in conflict with the law.

** Annual Report, Ministry of Social Services & Housing, 1987/88.

These services can be delivered most effectively using a range of lay and professional options. Self-help, lay and peer counselling are valuable tools but are not sufficient to meet all needs. Adequate professional services must be made available. Cost-effectiveness should be a consideration. Additional counselling through the existing infrastructure of service delivery via the family doctor, public health nurse or social worker needs strong consideration. In some instances, treatment and counselling by a psychiatrist is necessary. In many instances, the services of a psychologist or a professional counsellor are appropriate and less costly. Strategies to provide funding for all types of counselling must be evaluated.

Women's Centres have been instrumental in filling this gap in many communities. However, Women's Centre's do not exist in all communities and federal funding for Women's Centres does not cover the delivery of social and health services. Also, core funding will not be available past March 31, 1991. As noted earlier in this report, this matter is under discussion. Attempting to fill service gaps on an exclusively voluntary basis is not an option.

Service needs must constantly be assessed so that appropriate programs can be developed to respond effectively to emerging issues. For example, twenty years ago child sexual abuse and wife assault were thought to occur infrequently and were treated as relatively isolated incidences of aberrant behaviour. Today we recognize that both types of abuse happen regularly. Today's emerging issues include elder abuse and ritual abuse. Social service and law-enforcement agencies are seeing more of these types of cases and are struggling to respond. Few existing resources are able to deal with women seeking protection in these situations. **An effective delivery system must have the capacity to respond to changing needs.**

There is considerable debate as to which ministry has the responsibility to fill these service gaps. However, the need for these services is critical. No real progress can be expected until we deal with the effects of violence and sexual abuse on women's and children's lives. All our efforts to assist women to achieve economic independence and to participate equally in all aspects of life will be meaningless to women whose daily existence is dominated by abuse or the effects of past abuse. The provincial government must take action to ensure that provision of these much needed services is mandated and that delivery is coordinated.

IV. SERVICE DELIVERY

A. The Existing Delivery Structure

The Council looked at a variety of different delivery systems such as multi-service agencies and collaborative, cooperative and single focus systems. It was concluded that the design features of the system are more important than the type of system. For example, not every community is currently served by a Women's Centre, yet many communities without centres have services for women. Services to women are delivered differently from one community to another through a variety of means including women's centres, family service agencies and other community organizations.

Similarly, funding of existing services comes from many different sources. A wide variety of programs are funded by different provincial government ministries either through purchase of service contracts or grants. Funding is also provided by municipal and federal governments. Also municipal governments often provide support in kind such as office space. A considerable amount of funding is also raised at the community level through fundraising bodies such as the United Way and through individual agencies' fundraising initiatives. For example, increasing numbers of agencies are raising funds through bingo and casino licences. Many agencies also depend on the unpaid labour of volunteers to provide or supplement service delivery. While the monetary value of this labour is difficult to determine, it cannot be underestimated in terms of its impact on service delivery.

Organizations with a broad mixed funding base have greater flexibility to provide programs not currently funded through government and, by doing so, demonstrate the need for the program. They can be innovators, risk-takers and change agents. Reliance on single-source funding can result in program vulnerability for the following reasons: loss of funding means loss of the entire program; single-source funding means annual program instability; and single-source funding undermines autonomy.

B. Delivery Considerations

There are four key issues that must be addressed in order to support an effective delivery system capable of achieving results. They are:

* service availability, accessibility and adequacy;
* attitudes toward women;
* women's role in leadership and decision-making; and
* a structure within government and communities that ensures effective coordination, planning and evaluation.

1. Service Availability, Accessibility and Adequacy

The Advisory Council reviewed many programs offered by the provincial government from the perspective of their impact on communities. The Council received briefs and heard presentations from key line ministries describing the programs available at the community level, how they are accessed and their degree of availability. Many Council members have extensive knowledge of how these programs are delivered and the problems experienced by both service providers and consumers.

The Advisory Council identified the following major service needs:

a) service design must address access by women, with particular sensitivity to doubly disadvantaged women:*

* It must be noted that the difficulties experienced by women in accessing existing programs are intensified for doubly disadvantaged women. The term "doubly disadvantaged" includes groups such as: Native women, immigrant and visible minority women, disabled women, rural women, poor, elderly, lesbian and street women. Sufficient resources must be available to ensure program design addresses access for these groups. The needs of women in these groups are greater and they often have fewer personal resources to draw upon.

b) excellent programs exist but they are not available in sufficient quantity, or are not uniformly available throughout the province;

c) critical service gaps exist, particularly in the area of childcare and counselling services;

d) interministry coordination at the regional level is essential for effective service planning and delivery at the local level; and

e) local community planning is necessary to ensure effective coordination and use of resources.

Effective community level coordination of service is dependent on having a base of current information which describes the services available from all sources for women. This information is required at both the provincial and community levels. Informed consumers and service providers will make better use of existing resources.

Service availability, accessibility and adequacy issues are described in detail in Section III. In the recommendations, the Advisory Council has identified specific responsibilities at the provincial government level that are required to remedy the situation.

2. Public Education, Information and Awareness

No matter how many excellent services we deliver at the community level, change will be marginal unless we are able to confront and deal positively with stereotypical attitudes about the roles of women and their contribution to society. In particular, a strong, unequivocal message must be delivered that violence against women will not be tolerated.

There are many ways in which this task can be approached. These include education, leadership by example and public awareness campaigns.

Certainly, we need to focus our efforts in addressing these issues with children. The Advisory Council supports the recommendations of the Royal Commission on Education regarding gender equity. The Council commends the Ministry of Education for taking action to introduce gender equity in curriculum and learning materials, and looks forward to evaluating the outcome of these initiatives in the near future.

It is equally important that this effort goes beyond simply removing gender bias from existing materials and curriculum, and extends to providing learning materials which feature women's contributions to, and achievements in, our society. As well, the continued provision of conflict resolution training which focuses on common objectives rather than differences is commendable and, hopefully, will eventually negate our acceptance of violence as a way of resolving conflicts.

The provincial government must take a leadership role in addressing the impact of attitudes across all ministries and government bodies. This may take several forms, such as:

* acting as a model employer by introducing initiatives to ensure employment equity in the provincial government;

* providing increased training to sensitize all provincial government personnel to employment equity issues, including cultural issues, in order to create a more hospitable workplace and a sensitive approach to service delivery;

* providing training to statutory arms of government such as the judiciary and police, and major service providers such as schools and the medical community, to increase awareness of, and sensitivity to, barriers facing women;

* not subscribing to organizations that practice discriminatory behaviour and taking strong action against discriminatory behaviour of any kind; and

* removing gender bias from all public documents including reports, brochures, policies, etc.

Initiatives must be supported to reinforce attitudes in the general public which convey a respect for women's contributions and which increase awareness of the barriers women still face.

Finally, a variety of means can be used to increase public awareness. The provincial government has had considerable experience in public awareness campaigns such as the TRY, drinking/driving, and seat belt campaigns. Based on this broad range of experience, a public awareness campaign could be developed.

3. Women In Decision-Making and Leadership

Women must have a voice in decision-making to ensure that community-based programs are responsive to women's needs. This must occur at all levels and it must represent all women including Native, immigrant and visible minority women. Communities need to ensure that women are encouraged and supported in developing their leadership capabilities. Empowerment at the grassroots level is essential to democratic participation.

Women have traditionally been under-represented in decision-making bodies such as the judiciary, senior management, political office, boards, commissions and advisory bodies. These bodies have a direct impact on how policy decisions are made -- decisions which affect women. The provincial government must take progressive action to bring women into the mainstream of decision-making.

This under-representation has a double impact in the education system. Women, who represent 56% of teachers, make up only 4% of school administrators. Our children may spend their formative years with a one-dimensional view of women's roles, abilities and contributions. The attitudes and beliefs of these same children will form the basis of how they view the world ten years from now. It is essential that the provincial government take action to influence school boards to equitably represent women in all decision-making levels in the school system.

The provincial government can play a leadership role by ensuring gender equity in all boards, commissions and advisory councils that it is responsible for and by taking action to increase the representation of women at the senior management levels in government. As of January 1990, women made up 55% of all government employees, but only 27.5% of all management level staff. Although the number of women in management increased 10.2% in the past four years, at the current rate of progress it will take until 2001 for women to be equally represented in management. Even then, women will still be disproportionately represented in the junior management levels. Women currently represent 12.2% of senior management, an increase of 5.8% over the last four years. At this rate, it will take 30 years for women to be equally represented in senior management.

Taking action to redress these imbalances would have a two-fold benefit: it would result in a broader perspective in decision-making and it would signal to the private sector the importance of drawing from the broadest base of resources.

4. Coordination and Planning

A government-wide commitment to provide programs that effectively meet the needs of women is essential to the success of any community-based delivery system. The following elements need to be in place:

* the capacity within each ministry to assess policy impacts on women, for existing as well as new programs;

* a formalized interministerial coordination and planning mechanism; and

* a means of evaluating for accountability based on achievement of measurable results.

A structure exists within each ministry which could accommodate coordination and planning considerations. Currently each ministry has a Women's Advisor in place to address employment equity issues in government. This structure could be used to address the impact of policies on women as a regular feature of planning.

Interministry cooperation and coordination of services is essential to respond effectively to women's needs at the community level and to ensure that delivery is carried out efficiently. Planning and coordination between ministries could be achieved using a model similar to the Inter-Ministry Children's Committee. The results of this type of cooperative arrangement can be seen in protocols such as those described in the Child Abuse Handbook. The Council is aware that interministry planning is currently underway in relation to some specific issues such as wife assault. The mandate of an existing interministry committee could be expanded to allow for planning of community-based programs.

Following are two examples of program needs which will require coordination between ministries in order to be successfully addressed. Both examples are related to immigrant women, many of whom become isolated in our culture through language difficulties or their inability to use their talents and skills. They are:

* a program to assist immigrant women with offshore credentials to become accredited; and

* improved coordination between provincial ministries and the federal government to deliver English as a Second Language (ESL) to adult immigrants and to increase the availability of support services, incentives and innovative delivery models such as Open Learning.

In order to ensure ministry accountability for achieving measurable results, there will need to be an expectation that each ministry articulates its goals and expected outcomes clearly, and that information on achievement of these outcomes is collected and monitored as an integral feature of planning.

Many community delivery organizations that deal primarily with women have come to recognize that most of the women who use their services have one common problem, and that is poverty. Until more proactive programs are introduced which assist women to overcome poverty, there will be limited gains for women in other areas.

In September 1989, approximately 52% of British Columbia's Income Assistance caseload comprised single women and single parent families, 82% of which are headed by women. This does not include women on income assistance who are in a two-parent family unit or in a childless relationship. The Ministry of Social Services and Housing's program to assist women in the transition from income assistance dependency to independence is a positive step. However, the efforts of that Ministry will continue to have limited effect if women are moving off assistance into poorly paying jobs, and lack the necessary supports and resources to succeed. An examination of this issue needs to take place within the context of the total economic structure so that economic independence becomes a viable option for these women.

C. DELIVERY SYSTEMS

In reviewing different delivery systems, the Council found that successful systems have the following common features:

* they have strong boards representing a cross-section of the community, and a variety of skills;

* they access funding from a variety of sources including all levels of government, the private sector and through fund-raising activities;

* they deliver a variety of services which are accessible to a broad range of women in the community; and

* they integrate program monitoring and evaluation into their planning cycle.

Not all communities have the resources to develop this type of service base. In fact, communities without this type of volunteer service core may be most in need. The provincial government can play a key role in encouraging communities to assess and plan for service needs by providing support and training in the areas of community development, staff and volunteer training, and fund-raising.

1. Supporting Principles for Proposed Delivery System

It is inappropriate for government to impose any one type of delivery system on communities. Recognizing that many excellent delivery systems exist in communities across the province, the Council identified the following guiding principles as essential to effective delivery of community-based programs:

* that the community is the best judge of its needs and that no two communities are exactly alike;

* that, in most cases, community-based organizations are the best equipped to deliver services in their community;

* that the delivery system developed must not be obtrusive and must respect existing planning and delivery mechanisms, and build on the resources already available through coordination, service needs assessment and service enhancement; and

* that the role of governments and other funding sources is to work with communities to ensure a coordinated response to their needs.

2. Levels of Need

Communities are at different stages of development in terms of providing services which meet women's needs. Some communities have been able to marshall resources and coordinate activities not only to deliver basic services, but also to fill service gaps. Other communities have not been successful in organizing to this degree, and many have no ability to respond to service gaps.

An effective delivery system should be able to respond on three levels:

* to assess community needs and articulate those needs as part of a service delivery plan;

* to develop an infrastructure of community resources, including information and referral, coordinated to deliver the required services; and

* to identify funding sources in those areas where funding is not available to support required services, and to take action to fill those gaps.

In order to assist communities that have been less successful in developing this type of system, the Council recommends that assistance, administered by the Ministry Responsible For Women's Programs, be provided to help communities to meet their needs. Clearly some communities will require more assistance than others.

3. Criteria for Effective Service Delivery

It is likely that service gaps exist uniformly across the province and that communities may need some form of assistance in filling these gaps.

Some communities may require assistance in maintaining existing programs. Other communities may require more basic support such as assistance to assess service needs and/or develop a coordinated community response. It is important that criteria be established which ensure that communities receive the appropriate type of assistance.

The following elements have been identified as the basic criteria for effective service delivery and should form the basis of any funding made available:

a) The funding application must be related to one or more of the identified areas of need which are: community needs assessment, community development and filling service gaps. Applications for funding to fill service gaps that fall within the mandate of a line ministry will be referred to the appropriate ministry and assistance will be provided by Women's Program staff to expedite the application. In instances where line ministries are unable to support the initiative, Women's Programs may undertake to provide funding until the line ministry is able to incorporate the issue into their program planning.

b) The application must reflect sound contracting practices including conformance with the Employment Standards Act and with Human Rights legislation.

c) Community organizations applying for funding should be registered not-for-profit societies which meet the requirements of the Society Act. Program delivery may also be accomplished through private contractors, municipalities, and so on, within the guidelines established to ensure public accountability.

d) The organization must be able to demonstrate a strong base of community support for its application. That support must be demonstrated in at least two ways: through letters of support from key agencies and organizations involved or interested in the delivery of the proposed service with the application describing the process of cooperation that was explored; and through funding commitments from a variety of sources such as self-funding, community fund-raising organizations, foundations and different levels of government.

e) The organization must be able to demonstrate that it supports the social, economic and political equality of women. That support can be demonstrated in a variety of ways including the role which women play in the organization at the voluntary and staff levels, the Charter or mission statement of the organization, and past projects

or initiatives undertaken which further the rights of women.

f) The organization must be able to demonstrate financial management skills either through past performance or by providing a three year financial management plan for the proposed service. Support should be made available from the Ministry Responsible for Women's Programs to assist groups in developing their plans.

g) The application should identify value for dollars requested by clearly defining: what service will be provided; who will receive the service; how it will be delivered; why the delivery mechanism selected is the most effective delivery mechanism; what the benefits will be of providing the service; and the implications of not providing the service.

h) All applications must include an evaluation component that includes reporting and monitoring mechanisms to ensure the evaluation addresses the achievement of intended outcomes. A consumer evaluation component should be included.

i) Project funding is appropriate to support community needs assessment and community development activities which could reasonably be expected to conclude within a specific period of time.

It should be noted that funding is required for operating costs in relation to filling service gaps. Earlier in this report, the Council suggested ways to plan for filling service gaps within existing line ministries. However, until that planning has taken place it is unrealistic to expect communities to fill these needs on a project basis without allowing for administrative costs. In the interim, core-funding should be made available for a period of three years. At that time, the need for continued core-funding can be evaluated

4. Evaluation

An effective delivery system does not involve a rigid structure in each community, rather it supports each community's unique capacity to respond. Its success also depends on the development of a planning process within the provincial government which reflects the needs of female service consumers as an integral part of policy development. In fact, the recommendations in this report seek to institutionalize this process at all levels and in all ministries, so that in the future there will be no need for a Ministry Responsible for Women's Programs.

In the meantime, it is important that the implementation of this proposed delivery system be carefully monitored to ensure that it is working as intended. A Standing Advisory Council is recommended to monitor the implementation of the community-based delivery system and to provide advice to the Minister Responsible for Women's Programs. This Council would have a limited term of appointment, would likely be required to meet on a quarterly or semi-annual basis, and would be made up of women with knowledge of the issues facing women, of current delivery systems, and of geographic and cultural considerations.

V. ACTION PLAN AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In order for effective community-based programs to be developed, several key elements must be in place. The role of the provincial government has been dealt with at some length, yet its involvement is not the sole requisite for success. Coordination of federal and municipal programs is essential. For example, municipal governments must be encouraged to participate in a variety of ways such as funding, providing physical space, access to resources, etc. Effective utilization and coordination of voluntary services provides the final element.

The provincial government has taken a lead role by appointing the Advisory Council on Community-Based Programs for Women to address this issue. Government continues to have a significant role to play in ensuring that provincial services are meeting the needs of women.

The following Action Plan outlines the major tasks that need to be attended to and the time frame in which they should be undertaken or completed. In the short time available to the Council, many important issues could only be dealt with superficially. This Action Plan should be viewed as a road map which points out the directions and provides milestones. A considerable amount of work remains to be done.

A. Development of Effective Planning Processes

Planning which recognizes the needs of female clients and provides a mechanism to develop responsive policies, procedures and programs is essential.

THE COUNCIL RECOMMENDS THE FOLLOWING:

1. That the provincial government articulate an expectation that all ministries formally consider policy impact on women as a regular feature of planning, and that all Cabinet and Treasury Board Submissions contain an Impact on Women statement. In the event that a significant impact is identified, the submission should be reviewed by the Ministry Responsible for Women's Programs prior to submitting to Cabinet or Treasury Board. **(Pages 14 - 19)**

BEGIN IMMEDIATELY

2. That ministries regularly review existing programs, policies and procedures to ensure that they do not create unintended barriers to women, and that ministries be held accountable for developing and implementing policies, programs and service delivery structures which ensure access by women. **(Pages 14 - 19)**

BEGIN BY SEPTEMBER 1990

3. That each ministry develop an action plan which: sets measurable objectives to address the service issues described in this report; outlines the ministry's ongoing initiatives to ensure that existing and new policies, procedures and programs result in accessible services and delivery systems that are responsive to the needs of women; and that each ministry report annually to the Minister Responsible for Women's Programs on the achievement of its objectives. **(Page 19)**

BEGIN BY SEPTEMBER 1990 - ONGOING

4. That the provincial government undertake to achieve an equal representation of qualified women on appointed boards, commissions, advisory bodies and in senior management in the provincial public service. **(Pages 17 & 18)**

BEGIN IMMEDIATELY, COMPLETE BY MARCH 1993 - ONGOING

5. That an interministry task force be established to develop an economic and social policy strategy and action plan to address the feminization of poverty. **(Page 19)**

IMMEDIATELY

6. That the Minister Responsible for Women's Programs be appointed as a member of Treasury Board to have input in identifying priorities for funding to ensure that sufficient resources are made available for services to women. **(Pages 14 - 19)**

IMMEDIATELY

7. That the Minister submit this Advisory Council's recommendations pertaining to health care to the Royal Commission on Health Care and Costs, and recommend that the Commission give consideration to women's health needs. **(Pages 8 & 9)**

IMMEDIATELY

B. Effective Delivery of Required Services

The need exists for a base of services and information to be delivered through a variety of mechanisms and available at the community level.

THE COUNCIL RECOMMENDS THE FOLLOWING:

1. That the provincial government recognize the need for additional and enhanced counselling services and that Cabinet assigns responsibility to the appropriate ministries and takes action to ensure that the services are delivered to women across the province on a priority basis. **(Pages 8 - 12)**

IMMEDIATELY

2. That the provincial government take immediate action to resolve the shortfall of affordable, quality daycare spaces, and develop an integrated plan involving the full range of care options to address this shortfall. Further, that a progress report be presented to the Standing Advisory Council within six months. **(Page 7)**

BY JANUARY 1991

3. That the provincial government provide substantially increased training and education to women to remove barriers to their equal participation in the workforce. **(Page 9)**

BY APRIL 1991

4. That the provincial government provide support and assistance to community groups to develop community-based systems for the local delivery of programs to women by: providing funding for training in the areas of fund-raising, community needs assessment, community development, and volunteer/staff recruitment and training; and by funding service gaps until provision of the services can be articulated in line ministry mandates. **(Pages 19 - 24)**

IMMEDIATELY

5. That the Ministry Responsible for Women's Programs be given an adequate budget to: fill service gaps until line ministries are able to accommodate the services within their mandate; and assist community organizations to develop an adequate delivery system to respond to the needs of women based on the service delivery criteria outlined in this report. **(Pages 10 - 12, 14 & 19 - 24)**

IMMEDIATELY

6. That the provincial government work with the federal government to develop an effective approach to assist women with offshore credentials to become accredited. **(Page 19)**

BY MARCH 1991

7. That the Ministry of Advanced Education, Training and Technology be directed by Cabinet to: establish a process to assess the availability and accessibility of ESL services from all sources; and to develop a strategy to deliver effective, expanded ESL programs. The provision of support services to people who have had basic ESL training but require reinforcement of language skills as well as additional training must be included. **(Page 19)**

BEGIN IMMEDIATELY, COMPLETE BY MARCH 1991

C. Coordination Between the Government and Community

The Council stresses the need for coordination between all stakeholders including government and non-government organizations, not-for-profit and for-profit service delivery organizations, advocacy groups, service clubs and fund-raising organizations.

THE COUNCIL RECOMMENDS THE FOLLOWING:

1. That the provincial government establish a sub-committee of the Cabinet Committee on Social Policy, chaired by the Minister Responsible for Women's Programs, to address the coordination of delivery of provincial government programs to women at the community level and to address the needs of women as service consumers. **(Pages 14 - 19)**

IMMEDIATELY

2. That planning/coordination committees made up of provincial government ministries and community organizations be formally established at the regional level to assist the effective delivery of services to women in the community. **(Pages 18 - 19)**

BY SEPTEMBER 1990

D. Leadership Initiatives

Government needs to take the initiative and signal to all organizations and individuals its commitment to redress the current disparities.

THE COUNCIL RECOMMENDS THE FOLLOWING:

1. That government implement the following leadership initiatives to demonstrate its commitment to the equal participation of women: introduce an employment equity program across government; provide training to all provincial government personnel on systemic discrimination; remove gender bias from all public documents; and introduce a government-wide policy to subscribe only to organizations which are not discriminatory. **(Page 16)**

BY SEPTEMBER 1991

2. That government undertake a public awareness campaign to increase understanding of the barriers still facing women, to promote their status as equal participants in all arenas and to recognize the contributions that women make. (Pages 15 & 16)

BY APRIL 1991

E. Monitoring and Evaluating for Results

The recommendations contained in this Report present a significant challenge to government. It is important to be able to gauge progress and to assess what works and what does not. The availability of baseline data on women both as service consumers and as government employees is essential to effective monitoring and evaluation.

THE COUNCIL RECOMMENDS THE FOLLOWING:

1. That all ministries gather and maintain statistical program and personnel data by gender and community, and that data be made available to the Ministry Responsible for Women's Programs on request. (Page 19)

BEGIN IMMEDIATELY

2. That a Standing Advisory Council be established to provide advice to the Minister over the next year on the impact of the implementation of the initiatives and recommendations contained in this Report on community-based services. (Page 24)

IMMEDIATELY

Adoption of the above recommendations, in particular those regarding increased daycare spaces and the appointment of a Standing Advisory Council, will signal government's commitment to the women of this province. The Council looks forward to aggressive action from the provincial government to advance the equality of women.

APPENDIX A

ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS

MINISTER'S ADVISORY COUNCIL ON COMMUNITY-BASED PROGRAMS FOR WOMEN

The women on this committee served as individuals who brought their personal and professional experiences to the deliberations.

Susan Brice, Chairperson
Mayor
Oak Bay

Finola Finlay
Principal, Fort St. John Campus
Northern Lights College

Lois Hollstedt
Executive Director
Vancouver, Young Women's Christian Association

Mobina Jaffer
President
Immigrant and Visible Minority Women
in British Columbia

Rozmin Kamani, M.D.
Past President
Federation of Medical Women of Canada
(British Columbia Chapter)

Robin LeDrew
Spokesperson
B.C./Yukon Association of Women's Centres

Betty McClurg
Executive Director
Langley Family Services Association

Irene McRae
Executive Director
Deltassist Community Services

Betty Pepper
President
Provincial Council of Women of British Columbia

Patreace Sinclair
Developer/Counsellor
New Door Second Stage Transition
Housing Society

APPENDIX A (cont'd)

Kathie Taylor
Past President
Western Business Women's Association

Ruth Williams
Executive Director
Interior Indian Friendship Centre

APPENDIX B

TERMS OF REFERENCE

MINISTER'S ADVISORY COUNCIL ON COMMUNITY-BASED PROGRAMS FOR WOMEN

OBJECTIVE:

Reporting to the Honourable Carol Gran, Minister Responsible for Women's Programs, the Advisory Council on Community-Based Programs for Women will:

* work with British Columbia Ministries, the Federal Government and communities to examine the delivery of women's programs at all levels to identify gaps and possible duplications in services to women; and,

* recommend a long-term strategy for community-based program delivery involving co-ordination of existing community and government resources.

TERMS OF REFERENCE:

1. The Minister's Advisory Council on Community-Based Programs for Women will:

   (a) review existing programs and services offered through ministries, community groups, municipalities and other sources;

   (b) identify initiatives to enhance co-operation and increase the involvement, at the community level, of various groups in the private, public and non-profit sectors;

   (c) consult with organizations and groups to identify one or more cost-effective, community-based delivery models;

   (d) prepare a confidential report and recommendations for the Minister, within 6 weeks, on a cost-effective strategy to establish delivery models which encourage development of community-based support programs for women; and,

APPENDIX B (cont'd)

(e) ensure that the views of diverse interest groups at the local community level throughout the Province are represented in the advice provided to the Minister.

2. The Council may:

(a) request and receive submissions and suggestions from individuals and groups concerning this topic;

(b) participate in meetings with local community organizations, businesses and local government.

3. Members are appointed for a period not exceeding 3 months. The Committee will meet on a regular basis with leadership from the Chairperson and meet with the Minister as required.

4. The Ministry Responsible for Women's Programs will handle financial and accounting procedures on behalf of the Council. Council costs may include travel expenses for members and other meeting expenses.

5. Administrative support to coordinate Advisory Council meetings and events, document proceedings, and produce Advisory Council reports will be provided to the Council by Women's Program staff.

6. Advisory Council reports are the property of the Ministry and will be made public at the discretion of the Minister Responsible for Women's Programs.

7. Advisory Council members have been chosen on the basis of their knowledge and expertise as well as their representation of the various sectors of the community.

8. Senior government officials will be available to assist the Council regarding issues or programs in which their ministries have special expertise or information.

APPENDIX C

GOVERNMENT REPRESENTATIVES AND OBSERVERS

MINISTER'S ADVISORY COUNCIL ON COMMUNITY-BASED PROGRAMS FOR WOMEN

PROVINCIAL MINISTRY REPRESENTATIVES

Ministry of Advanced Education, Training and Technology

Heather Dickson
Senior Advisor

Gwen Armstrong
Coordinator
Adult Basic Education

Gail Thomas
Policy Analyst
Labour Market Policy Division

Ministry of Attorney General

Krysia Strawczynski
Assistant Deputy Minister

Brian Pollock
Managing Director
Family Maintenance Enforcement Program

Ministry of Education

Shirley McBride
Director
Special Education Branch

Ministry of Health

Vicki Farrally
Director
Health Economics and Planning Branch

Jennifer Charlesworth
Associate Director
Policy

Laverne Bennett
Women's Advisor

APPENDIX C (cont'd)

Ministry of Health (cont'd)

June Wick
Director
Public Health Nursing and Community Support

Ministry of Government Management Services and Ministry Responsible for Women's Programs

Christine Bullen
Assistant Deputy Minister
Women's Programs

Dyan Dunsmoor-Farley
Director
Program Development and Promotion
Women's Programs

Valerie Baines Vrlak
Communications Consultant
Office of the Minister

Ministry of International Business and Immigration

Cathy Stigant
Senior Policy Analyst

Ministry of Labour

Roberta Burris
Manager
Community Awareness
Alcohol and Drug Programs

Ministry of Regional and Economic Development

Steve Hollett
Assistant Deputy Minister

Wendy Klyne
Manager
Home-Based Business Program

APPENDIX C (cont'd)

Ministry of Social Services and Housing

Fran Sadler
Assistant Director
Rehabilitation and Support Services

Deborah Nilsen
Manager
Family Maintenance Program

Ministry of Solicitor General

Wendy Galloway
Director
Women's Programs

FEDERAL OBSERVERS

Secretary of State

Wendy L. Carter
Regional Director
BC/Yukon Region, Regional Office

Cindy McKinley (alternate)
Assistant Regional Director
Social Development
BC/Yukon Region, Regional Office